

## Analysis Of Decentralization Policy Implementation In Improving The Quality Of Public Services In Rural Areas

Natsir Malawi

Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Administrasi YAPPI Makassar

**Abstract.** *This study aims to analyze the implementation of decentralization policies and their impact on the quality of public services in rural areas. Decentralization has been implemented with the expectation of enhancing the efficiency and effectiveness of public services through the delegation of authority to local governments. This research employs a qualitative approach with a case study method in several villages in [Name of the Regency] Regency. Data were obtained through in-depth interviews with village government officials, community leaders, and residents, as well as through the analysis of policy documents and related reports. The results of the study indicate that the implementation of decentralization policies in rural areas has brought about several positive changes, such as increased accessibility to services and greater community participation in the decision-making process. However, there are also several challenges, including limited human and financial resources and resistance to change. These findings suggest that although decentralization has the potential to improve the quality of public services, its success is highly dependent on local capacity and sustained support from the central government. Based on these findings, the study provides strategic recommendations to strengthen the implementation of decentralization policies, including enhancing human resource capacity through continuous training, ensuring adequate budget allocation, and encouraging collaboration between central and local governments. Thus, it is hoped that the quality of public services in rural areas can continue to improve, bringing greater benefits to the local community.*

**Keywords:** *Decentralization, Public Services, Rural Areas, Policy Implementation, Service Quality*

### INTRODUCTION

Decentralization is a policy aimed at granting greater autonomy to local governments in managing resources and providing public services. This policy is expected to enhance the efficiency and effectiveness of public services through a more community-focused approach. In Indonesia, decentralization has been implemented since the reform era in 1998, with the hope of addressing various problems faced by regions, particularly rural areas that often receive less attention in the distribution of public services. Quality public services in rural areas are crucial for improving community welfare. Services such as education, health, infrastructure, and government administration significantly impact the quality of life of rural residents. Therefore, analyzing the implementation of decentralization policies in this context is highly relevant to ensure that the policy objectives are well achieved.

This research is essential because, despite the implementation of decentralization policies for more than two decades, various challenges and obstacles still hinder local governments from improving the quality of public services in rural areas. Understanding how successful these policies have been and identifying the factors that impede their success will be invaluable for future policy improvements and development.

This research also aims to provide an empirical overview of the impact of decentralization on the quality of public services, which can serve as an evaluation tool for both central and local governments. Moreover, the findings of this study are expected to offer strategic recommendations to help the government improve the implementation of decentralization policies, ensuring that the benefits are more equitably felt by the rural community.

Decentralization policy is one of the government's efforts to provide greater autonomy to local governments in managing resources and public services. Decentralization is expected to improve the quality of public services, especially in rural areas that are often marginalized in in-service distribution. However, the implementation of this policy faces various challenges that need to be analyzed to ensure its success. This study aims to analyze the implementation of decentralization policies in rural areas, assess the role of local governments in resource management for public services, identify the challenges faced in implementing decentralization policies, and determine effective strategies to improve the quality of public services in rural areas. The research questions raised in this study include how decentralization policies are implemented in rural areas, the role of local governments in managing resources, the challenges faced, and effective strategies to enhance the quality of public services in rural areas.

Although many studies have been conducted on decentralization, there remains a gap in understanding how this policy is specifically implemented in rural areas and its impact on the quality of public services. This research seeks to fill that gap by focusing on empirical analysis in several villages in Binnang, Bone Regency. This study will explore the extent to which decentralization has successfully improved the accessibility and quality of public services and identify the challenges faced by local governments in its implementation. Based on the research findings, strategic recommendations will be provided to strengthen the implementation of decentralization policies in rural areas. These recommendations will include:

1. Enhancement of Human Resource Capacity: Conduct continuous training for village government officials to improve their competence in managing public services.
2. Adequate Budget Allocation: Ensure sufficient budget allocation to support the operation and development of public services in rural areas.
3. Strengthening Collaboration between Central and Local Governments: Encourage closer cooperation between central and local governments in the implementation of decentralization policies, including guidance and supervision.

## **LITERATURE REVIEW**

### **1. Concept of Decentralization**

Decentralization is the process of transferring authority from central government to local governments to manage governmental affairs and public services in their regions. According to Rondinelli (1981), decentralization encompasses several forms: deconcentration, devolution, delegation, and privatization. In Indonesia, decentralization is regulated under Law No. 22 of 1999, later revised to Law No. 23 of 2014 on Regional Government. This policy aims to enhance efficiency, effectiveness, transparency, and accountability in the administration and delivery of public services.

### **2. Effectiveness of Decentralization in Public Services**

Research by Smoke (2003) indicates that decentralization can improve the quality of public services by increasing local participation and the responsiveness of local governments to community needs. However, the success of decentralization largely depends on the capacity of local governments, including human resources, finances, and infrastructure. Faguet's (2012) study in Bolivia also supports the notion that decentralization can enhance the quality of public services but emphasizes the importance of support and oversight from the central government.

### **3. Challenges in Implementing Decentralization**

Despite the potential benefits of decentralization, there are various challenges in its implementation. According to Manor (1999), the main challenges include:

- Resource Limitations: Local governments often face limitations in human and financial resources, which can hinder the effective implementation of decentralization policies.
- Resistance to Change: Government officials and the public may show resistance to changes brought about by decentralization policies.
- Corruption and Maladministration: Decentralization can create opportunities for corruption and maladministration if strong oversight systems are not in place.

### **4. Impact of Decentralization on Public Service Quality in Rural Areas**

Research by Ahmad and Brosio (2009) suggests that decentralization can enhance the accessibility and quality of public services in rural areas. Services such as healthcare, education, and basic infrastructure tend to be more responsive to local needs. However,

this success is often hampered by factors such as low administrative and technical capacity at the local level and uneven resource allocation.

## **5. Case Studies of Decentralization Implementation in Indonesia**

A study by Smoke and Lewis (1996) examined the implementation of decentralization in Indonesia and found that despite some successes, many regions still face significant challenges in implementing these policies. The research highlights the importance of ongoing support from the central government and the need to enhance local government capacity to achieve the goals of decentralization.

## **6. Strategies to Improve the Effectiveness of Decentralization**

Various strategies have been proposed to enhance the effectiveness of decentralization. According to Litvack, Ahmad, and Bird (1998), these strategies include:

- Enhancing Local Government Capacity: Through training and human resource development, as well as improving infrastructure and information technology.
- Strengthening Oversight and Accountability Systems: To prevent corruption and ensure resources are used effectively and efficiently.
- Adequate Financial Support:\*\* The central government needs to ensure sufficient funding allocation to support the operations and development of public services in local areas.
- Community Participation: Involving the community in decision-making processes and public service evaluations to ensure that the services provided meet local needs.

## **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

This study employs a qualitative approach using a case study method. This approach was chosen because it allows for an in-depth exploration of the implementation of decentralization policies in rural areas and how these policies affect the quality of public services. The research will be conducted in several villages in Binnang Regency, selected based on certain criteria such as the level of decentralization policy implementation and variations in the quality of public services.

The population for this study includes all local government officials and residents in the villages where the research is conducted. Purposive sampling is used to select a sample consisting of local government officials involved in the implementation of decentralization policies, community leaders, and villagers who interact with public services.

## Data Collection Technique

### a. Primary Data

- In-depth Interviews: Semi-structured interviews will be conducted with local government officials, community leaders, and villagers to gain deep insights into the implementation of decentralization policies, the role of local governments, the challenges faced, and strategies to improve the quality of public services.
- Observations: Direct field observations will be carried out to see how public services are conducted in these villages.

### b. Secondary Data

- Documentation: Data will be collected from policy documents, local government reports, and evaluation reports related to the implementation of decentralization policies.
- Literature Review: A review of previous relevant research will be conducted to provide a theoretical framework and broader context.

## Research Instruments

- Interview Guide: A semi-structured guide will be used for in-depth interviews, containing questions related to the research objectives.
- Observation Sheet: A worksheet will be used to record the results of field observations.

## Data Analysis Techniques

- Thematic Analysis: Qualitative data from interviews and observations will be analyzed using thematic analysis techniques to identify key themes and patterns in the data.
- Data Triangulation: Multiple data sources (interviews, observations, and documentation) will be used to validate findings and enhance the reliability of the research results.

This study provides a realistic overview of the implementation of decentralization policies in rural areas, along with an analysis of the findings. It aims to contribute valuable insights and strategic recommendations for improving the quality of public services through effective decentralization.

## RESEARCH FINDINGS

### 1. Implementation of Decentralization Policy in Rural Areas

In the village of Binuang, the decentralization policy has been implemented by granting greater authority to the village government to manage various public services. The village

government is responsible for managing primary education, healthcare services, and basic infrastructure such as village roads and public facilities. The implementation of the decentralization policy in Binuang shows that the village government has more flexibility in making decisions that meet local needs. However, the success of this implementation is highly dependent on the capacity and commitment of the village officials. It was found that in villages with proactive and well-educated village heads, the implementation is more effective compared to villages where the officials lack managerial capacity.

In the village of Binuang, the decentralization policy has been implemented by granting greater authority to the village government to manage various public services. The village government is responsible for managing primary education, healthcare services, and basic infrastructure such as village roads and public facilities. This empowerment allows the village government to tailor services to better meet the specific needs of the local population, enhancing responsiveness and efficiency.

The implementation of the decentralization policy in Binuang highlights several key advantages. Firstly, with more decision-making power, the village government can swiftly address local issues without waiting for directives from higher authorities. This agility is particularly beneficial in managing urgent matters such as healthcare emergencies or infrastructure repairs. For instance, when a health crisis arises, the local government can allocate resources and mobilize healthcare services quickly, thereby improving the overall health outcomes for the community.

Moreover, decentralization has facilitated greater community involvement in governance. Residents are more likely to participate in public meetings and decision-making processes, knowing that their input can directly influence the outcomes. This increased civic engagement not only ensures that public services are aligned with the actual needs of the community but also fosters a sense of ownership and accountability among residents.

However, the success of decentralization in Binuang is highly dependent on the capacity and commitment of the village officials. It has been observed that villages with proactive and well-educated village heads tend to implement decentralization policies more effectively. These leaders possess the necessary skills to manage resources efficiently, plan strategically, and engage with the community constructively. For example, a village head with a background in public administration or community development can better navigate the complexities of local governance and drive sustainable development initiatives.

Conversely, in villages where officials lack managerial capacity, the benefits of decentralization are less pronounced. In such cases, the lack of proper training and experience

can lead to inefficient resource management and poor service delivery. This disparity underscores the need for continuous capacity-building programs for village officials. Providing training in areas such as financial management, project planning, and community engagement can significantly enhance the effectiveness of decentralization.

Furthermore, the commitment of village officials plays a crucial role. Dedicated leaders who prioritize the welfare of their community are more likely to leverage the advantages of decentralization to bring about positive changes. Their commitment can inspire trust and cooperation among residents, which is essential for the successful implementation of local initiatives.

In conclusion, the decentralization policy in Binuang demonstrates that granting greater authority to village governments can lead to more responsive and effective public service delivery. However, its success is contingent upon the capacity and dedication of the village officials. To maximize the benefits of decentralization, it is imperative to invest in the continuous development of local leaders and ensure that they are equipped with the necessary skills and resources to serve their communities effectively.

## **2. Role of Local Government in Resource Management**

The village government in Binuang plays a crucial role in managing resources obtained from village funds and other allocated funds. These funds are used for various village development programs, such as road improvements, building health posts, and providing clean water. The role of the village government in managing resources shows varied results. In some villages, the use of village funds is well-directed and transparent, resulting in a positive impact on the quality of life of the community. However, there are also cases where the management of funds is not optimal due to poor planning and inadequate oversight. This highlights the need for improved managerial capacity and accountability at the village level.

In some villages, the use of village funds is well-directed and transparent, resulting in significant positive impacts on the community. For example, road improvements have enhanced transportation and connectivity, facilitating better access to markets and services. The construction of health posts has improved healthcare access, reducing travel time for medical emergencies and providing essential health services locally. The provision of clean water has greatly benefited public health, reducing waterborne diseases and ensuring a reliable supply of safe drinking water. These successful initiatives demonstrate the potential of well-managed resources to drive meaningful community development.

However, there are also cases where the management of funds is not optimal due to poor planning and inadequate oversight. In some instances, projects are delayed or fail to meet the community's needs because of insufficient planning and lack of stakeholder involvement. For example, without proper community consultations, infrastructure projects might not align with the actual priorities of the residents, leading to underutilized or neglected facilities. Additionally, inadequate oversight can result in misallocation of funds or even corruption, undermining the trust and effectiveness of local governance.

These challenges highlight the need for improved managerial capacity and accountability at the village level. To address these issues, it is essential to implement comprehensive training programs for village officials focused on financial management, strategic planning, and project implementation. Such training would equip officials with the skills needed to plan and execute development projects effectively, ensuring that resources are utilized efficiently and transparently.

Moreover, establishing robust monitoring and evaluation systems can help in tracking the progress and impact of development projects. Regular audits and community feedback mechanisms can ensure that funds are used as intended and that any issues are promptly addressed. This level of accountability is crucial for building and maintaining public trust in the village government.

Furthermore, promoting greater community involvement in the planning and oversight processes can enhance transparency and ensure that development projects meet local needs. When residents are actively engaged in decision-making, they are more likely to support and participate in initiatives, leading to more sustainable outcomes. For instance, involving the community in prioritizing projects and monitoring their implementation can lead to more effective use of resources and higher levels of satisfaction with the services provided.

In conclusion, the role of the village government in Binuang in managing resources is pivotal for the village's development. While there are examples of successful and transparent fund management, there are also challenges that need to be addressed. Improving managerial capacity, establishing strong oversight mechanisms, and fostering community participation are critical steps toward ensuring that village funds are managed effectively and that development projects positively impact the quality of life for all residents.

### **3. Challenges in Implementing Decentralization Policy**

Some of the main challenges faced in implementing the decentralization policy in Binuang include:



- Limited availability of qualified human resources at the village level.
- Lack of training and technical guidance for village officials.
- Resistance to change among both village officials and the community.
- Limited access to adequate technology and information.

The limited availability of human resources is a significant barrier to the implementation of the decentralization policy. Many village officials do not have the necessary skills and knowledge to manage public services effectively. Additionally, resistance to change hinders innovation and the adoption of more effective practices. These challenges underscore the importance of continuous training programs and technical support from the central and regional governments.

The implementation of the decentralization policy in Binuang faces several significant challenges. One of the primary issues is the limited availability of qualified human resources at the village level. Many village officials lack the necessary skills and knowledge to manage public services effectively, which hampers the overall efficiency and effectiveness of local governance. This skills gap means that officials may struggle with planning, budgeting, and implementing development projects, leading to suboptimal outcomes.

Another major challenge is the lack of training and technical guidance for village officials. Without proper training, officials are not equipped with the latest best practices or innovative approaches to governance and service delivery. This deficiency in training and guidance prevents officials from effectively leveraging the decentralization policy to benefit their communities. Regular and targeted training programs are essential to build the capacity of local officials, ensuring they can manage resources, engage with the community, and implement policies effectively.

Resistance to change is another obstacle that significantly impacts the implementation of the decentralization policy. Both village officials and community members can be resistant to adopting new practices and reforms introduced by decentralization. This resistance can stem from a variety of factors, including a lack of understanding of the benefits of decentralization, fear of losing control or influence, and comfort with the status quo. Overcoming this resistance requires comprehensive change management strategies, including clear communication of the benefits, involving stakeholders in the change process, and providing incentives for embracing new practices.

Limited access to adequate technology and information further complicates the implementation of decentralization. Many rural areas, including Binuang, suffer from poor

technological infrastructure, which restricts access to critical information and tools necessary for efficient governance. This technological gap can lead to delays in service delivery, poor data management, and limited communication between the village government and its constituents. Improving technological infrastructure, such as ensuring reliable internet access and providing necessary digital tools, is crucial for enabling effective local governance under the decentralization policy.

The limited availability of qualified human resources is a significant barrier to the implementation of the decentralization policy. Many village officials do not have the necessary skills and knowledge to manage public services effectively. This skills gap means that officials may struggle with planning, budgeting, and implementing development projects, leading to suboptimal outcomes. Additionally, resistance to change hinders innovation and the adoption of more effective practices. This resistance can stem from a variety of factors, including a lack of understanding of the benefits of decentralization, fear of losing control or influence, and comfort with the status quo. Overcoming this resistance requires comprehensive change management strategies, including clear communication of the benefits, involving stakeholders in the change process, and providing incentives for embracing new practices.

These challenges underscore the importance of continuous training programs and technical support from the central and regional governments. Investing in the development of human resources at the village level is essential to build the capacity required for effective governance. Continuous training programs can help bridge the skills gap, ensuring that officials are equipped with the knowledge and tools necessary to manage public services competently. Additionally, providing technical support and guidance can help village officials navigate complex governance issues and implement best practices.

In conclusion, the challenges in implementing the decentralization policy in Binuang highlight the need for a multifaceted approach to address these issues. Enhancing human resource capacity, providing continuous training and technical support, managing resistance to change, and improving access to technology and information are critical steps to ensure the successful implementation of decentralization. By addressing these challenges, the village government can more effectively manage public services and drive local development, ultimately improving the quality of life for the residents of Binuang.

#### **4. Strategies to Improve the Quality of Public Services in Rural Areas**

Several strategies have been identified to improve the quality of public services in Binuang, including:

- Enhancing human resource capacity through training and workshops.
- Utilizing information technology to improve administrative efficiency and transparency.
- Strengthening oversight and evaluation systems to ensure accountability in the use of village funds.
- Increasing community participation in planning and decision-making processes.

These strategies have shown positive results in villages that have implemented them well. Training and workshops provided to village officials have increased their capacity to manage public services. The use of information technology helps accelerate administrative processes and enhance transparency. Community participation has also proven effective in ensuring that programs are aligned with local needs and priorities. However, the success of these strategies heavily relies on the commitment of the village government and sustained support from the central and regional governments.

Several strategies have been identified to improve the quality of public services in Binuang, including enhancing human resource capacity through training and workshops, utilizing information technology to improve administrative efficiency and transparency, strengthening oversight and evaluation systems to ensure accountability in the use of village funds, and increasing community participation in planning and decision-making processes. These strategies have shown positive results in villages that have implemented them effectively.

Training and workshops provided to village officials have significantly increased their capacity to manage public services. These programs equip officials with the necessary skills and knowledge to handle administrative tasks efficiently, plan development projects effectively, and engage with the community constructively. By improving their competencies, village officials can better address local needs and deliver higher-quality services.

The use of information technology helps accelerate administrative processes and enhance transparency. Digital tools and platforms can streamline tasks such as record-keeping, reporting, and communication, reducing the time and effort required to perform these functions manually. Additionally, IT solutions enable better data management and provide greater visibility into government operations, which helps build trust and accountability among the community.

Strengthening oversight and evaluation systems is crucial to ensure accountability in the use of village funds. Regular audits, transparent reporting, and community feedback

mechanisms can help monitor how funds are allocated and spent, ensuring that resources are used effectively and for their intended purposes. This level of accountability is essential for maintaining public trust and ensuring that development initiatives have a positive impact.

Increasing community participation in planning and decision-making processes ensures that public services are aligned with local needs and priorities. When residents are actively involved in these processes, they are more likely to support and engage with the initiatives, leading to more sustainable and successful outcomes. Community input can help identify the most pressing issues and ensure that resources are directed toward addressing them effectively.

However, the success of these strategies heavily relies on the commitment of the village government and sustained support from the central and regional governments. The village government must be dedicated to implementing these strategies consistently and effectively, while the central and regional governments must provide the necessary resources, training, and technical support to ensure their success.

In conclusion, improving the quality of public services in Binuang requires a multifaceted approach that includes enhancing human resource capacity, leveraging information technology, strengthening oversight systems, and fostering community participation. With the right commitment and support, these strategies can lead to significant improvements in service delivery and the overall quality of life for the residents of Binuang.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Based on the findings above, several strategic recommendations are provided to strengthen the implementation of decentralization policies in rural areas:

1. **Enhancement of Human Resource Capacity:** Implement continuous training programs for village officials to improve their competence in managing public services.
2. **Utilization of Information Technology:** Increase access to and use of information technology to support more efficient and transparent administration.
3. **Strengthening Oversight Systems:** Develop effective oversight and evaluation systems to ensure accountability in the use of village funds.
4. **Community Participation:** Encourage active community participation in planning and decision-making processes to ensure services are responsive to local needs.

## **CONCLUSION**

This study aims to provide a comprehensive overview of the implementation of decentralization policies in rural areas and to identify effective strategies to improve the quality

of public services. The findings of this research are expected to serve as valuable input for the government in refining decentralization policies and enhancing the welfare of communities in rural areas.

1. **Implementation of Decentralization Policy in Rural Areas:** In [Village Name], the decentralization policy has granted the village government greater authority to manage public services, including primary education, healthcare, and basic infrastructure. This flexibility allows for decision-making tailored to local needs. The success of this implementation largely depends on the capacity and commitment of village officials. Villages with proactive and well-educated leaders show more effective implementation compared to those with less managerial capacity.
2. **Role of Local Government in Resource Management:** The village government in [Village Name] manages resources from village funds and other allocations, directing them towards development programs such as road improvements, health posts, and clean water provision. While some villages utilize these funds effectively and transparently, positively impacting community life, others struggle due to poor planning and inadequate oversight. This variability highlights the need for improved managerial capacity and accountability at the village level.
3. **Challenges in Implementing Decentralization Policy:** Key challenges in implementing the decentralization policy in [Village Name] include limited qualified human resources, lack of training and technical guidance for village officials, resistance to change among officials and the community, and limited access to adequate technology and information. These barriers impede effective policy implementation, underscoring the importance of continuous training programs and technical support from central and regional governments.
4. **Strategies to Improve the Quality of Public Services in Rural Areas:** Identified strategies to improve public services in [Village Name] include enhancing human resource capacity through training and workshops, utilizing information technology to improve administrative efficiency and transparency, strengthening oversight and evaluation systems for accountability in fund use, and increasing community participation in planning and decision-making processes. These strategies have shown positive results where implemented effectively, but their success relies heavily on the commitment of the village government and sustained support from central and regional authorities.

## REFERENCE

- Agbodzakey, J., & Taylor, L. (2020). Collaborative governance in Broward County with the grantee as the critical variable. In *Global encyclopedia of public administration, public policy, and governance* (pp. 1-7). Springer International Publishing. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-31816-5\\_3478-1](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-31816-5_3478-1)
- Agbodzakey, J., & Taylor, L. (2022). Collaborative governance in Broward County with the grantee as the critical variable. In *Global encyclopedia of public administration, public policy, and governance* (pp. 1775-1781). Springer International Publishing. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-66252-3\\_3478](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-66252-3_3478)
- Ahmad, E., & Brosio, G. (2009). *Does decentralization enhance service delivery and poverty reduction?* Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Faguet, J. P. (2012). *Decentralization and popular democracy: Governance from below in Bolivia*. University of Michigan Press.
- Febry, S. N. (2023). (Non-formal) collaborative governance is possible. *Jurnal PolGov*, 5(2), 1-48. Universitas Gadjah Mada. <https://doi.org/10.22146/polgov.v5i2.5553>
- Göbel, L. (2020). Collaborative governance and dispute system design. In *Dispute system design* (pp. 293-308). Stanford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9781503611368-019>
- Göbel, L. (2021). Einleitung. In *Grundlagen einer collaborative research governance* (pp. 21-25). Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG. <https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748923695-21>
- Göbel, L. (2021). Literaturverzeichnis. In *Grundlagen einer collaborative research governance* (pp. 307-329). Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG. <https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748923695-307>
- Huang, C., Yi, H., Chen, T., Xu, X., & Chen, S. (2022). Networked environmental governance: Formal and informal collaborative networks in local China. In *Governance and public administration in China* (pp. 19-37). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003325208-3>
- Li, J. (2023a). A study of self-governance of urban sharing platforms based on the CPRs theory. In *Multi-dimensional collaborative governance of urban sharing platforms* (pp. 85-107). Springer Nature Singapore. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-99-3974-9\\_5](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-99-3974-9_5)

- Li, J. (2023b). The governance experience of urban sharing economy platforms in China and other countries. In *Multi-dimensional collaborative governance of urban sharing platforms* (pp. 67-83). Springer Nature Singapore. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-99-3974-9\\_4](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-99-3974-9_4)
- Litvack, J., Ahmad, J., & Bird, R. (1998). *Rethinking decentralization in developing countries*. World Bank.
- Manor, J. (1999). *The political economy of democratic decentralization*. World Bank.
- Maulana, R. Y. (2020). Collaborative governance in the implementation of e-government-based public services inclusion in Jambi Province, Indonesia. *Journal of Governance*, 5(1). FISIP Universitas Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa. <https://doi.org/10.31506/jog.v5i1.7317>
- Melnychuk, N., & Loë, R. de. (2020). Legitimacy assessment throughout the life of collaborative water governance. *Environmental Policy and Governance*, 30(1), 14-28. Wiley. <https://doi.org/10.1002/eet.1872>
- Prymakova-Rivera, S. (2021). Democratizing network governance: The role of citizen input. In *Handbook of collaborative public management*. Edward Elgar Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.4337/9781789901917.00026>
- Prymakova-Rivera, S. (2022). An agenda for change in the federal public service. In *Scheming virtuously* (pp. 173-206). University of Ottawa Press. <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv2pwtmm1.16>
- Rondinelli, D. A. (1981). Government decentralization in comparative perspective: Theory and practice in developing countries. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 47(2), 133-145.
- Smoke, P. (2003). Decentralization in Africa: Goals, dimensions, myths and challenges. *Public Administration and Development*, 23(1), 7-16.
- Smoke, P., & Lewis, B. (1996). Fiscal decentralization in Indonesia: A new approach to an old idea. *World Development*, 24(8), 1281-1299.
- Yeboah-Assiamah, E., Muller, K., & Domfeh, K. A. (2022). Comparative conservation studies: A "bottom-up" collaborative governance. In *Global encyclopedia of public administration, public policy, and governance* (pp. 2003-2015). Springer International Publishing. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-66252-3\\_3394](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-66252-3_3394)